

**N21 (R300) CAPE TOWN RING ROAD
MINUTES OF FOCUS GROUP MEETING NO. 8**

DATE: Monday, 23 July 2002
VENUE: Parks and Recreation Depot, Lentegeur
TIME: 10h00-11h30
FACILITATOR: Sadia Chand (Chand Environmental Consultants cc)

1. Attendance

Name	Organisation
M Botes	Councillor
G Pascoe	Councillor: Ward 78
A Arnolds	Councillor
M Fienies	Councillor
I Anthony	Area Co-ordinator
J Thuynsma	Councillor
H E M Busch	Councillor
R Haynie	Councillor
C Williams	Councillor
J Griffiths	Chairperson: Blueglen Community Forum
M Coto	City of Cape Town: Development Facilitation Unit
Andrew Officer	Goba Moahloli Keeve Steyn (Pty) Ltd
Brian Rossouw	Kayad
Sadia Chand	Chand Environmental Consultants
Emily Herschell	Chand/Ecosense JV
Poens Venter	Power Group of Companies

2. Introduction

S Chand opened the meeting at 10h00 and welcomed all those present. After introducing the team, she explained the agenda of the meeting: P Venter would first give a presentation, which would clarify the N21 (R300) Toll Ring Road Project in more detail. She would then explain the Environmental Impact Assessment process. A discussion session would follow, in which all questions would be answered.

3. The Peninsula Expressway Consortium

P Venter introduced the Peninsula Expressway Consortium as consisting of a mixture of local expertise and empowerment groups, that is the:

- Project Sponsors:
Murray & Roberts
Power Group of Companies
African Renaissance
- Construction Companies:
Murray & Roberts
Power Construction
- Toll Operating Company:
Tolcon
- Consulting Engineers:
Goba Moahloli Keeve Steyn
ASCH
Kayad
Jeffares and Green

- Financial Advisors:
PricewaterhouseCoopers

4. Project History

P Venter noted that the concept for this project had arisen in 1996 and Western Cape Cabinet Approvals had been given on the:

- 14 May 1997; and
- 18 February 1998.

After submitting a proposal to the South African National Roads Agency Limited (SANRAL) in October of 1998, Penway were awarded Scheme Developer status in January 2000 to develop their unsolicited proposal. An agreement was signed where Penway was allowed to develop the scheme on an exclusive basis.

The project has been split into two phases, the first of which, the Initial Phase of Scheme Development, was completed in November 2000. After due consideration that the project was feasible, SANRAL granted approval for Penway to proceed with the second phase, the Final Phase of Scheme Development, in July 2001. An agreement (with project specific and strategic conditions) was signed in November 2001 to proceed with this phase.

P Venter went on to describe that important approvals had been received, specifically from:

- Western Cape Premier: 10 May 2001
- Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism: 14 May 2001
(accepted the Scoping Report)
- City of Cape Town: 23 May 2001

5. Project Locality

P Venter described that in general, the road would consist of a limited access freeway of two/four/six lanes. The former means that one could only access the road through an intersection. The road would be public transport-friendly and would use an electronic toll collection system, over a 30 year concession period.

P Venter also explained that the route north of Durbanville followed a new alignment, planned by the then Blaauwberg Municipality: the East-West Arterial. He noted that this section had already been through a Scoping Phase and a letter of comment had been received from the Department of Environment, Cultural Affairs and Sport.

P Venter stated that the Philippi Link was originally proposed as an alternative to the toll road, however the traffic model indicated that it made sense to include it as well because it:

- a) Served two different traffic catchment areas and
- b) Enhanced the entire scheme.

This sector has undergone an extensive Scoping Phase and the Cape Metropolitan Council requested a full Environmental Impact Assessment to be conducted on it. A Record of Decision has been issued on this road. He also noted that as a result of this, extensive discussions with the farmers from this area had been conducted, however Penway still needed to and would carry out the public participation process with these Interested and Affected Parties on the tolling issue.

He added that the City of Cape Town had granted Penway permission to make use of the planning for the Blaauwberg East-West Arterial and the Cape Flats Freeway Alignment.

P Venter noted that this information could also be found on the website:
www.peninsula-expressway.org.za

8. The Environmental Impact Assessment Process

8.1 The Scoping Process

S Chand explained that a Scoping Study was undertaken in accordance with the requirements of the Environmental Conservation Act No. 73 of 1989 and the National Environmental Management Act No. 107 of 1998. This took place from February to November 2000.

The Scoping exercise entailed initial specialist studies and public participation process. The Final Scoping Report was submitted and approved by the two environmental authorities, the Department of Environmental and Cultural Affairs and Sport (DECAS) and the Department of Environment Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) in Pretoria.

8.2 Impact Assessment

Based on the results of the Scoping Report, a Plan of Study for an Environmental Impact Assessment was submitted to the environmental authorities during May 2001. Approval for an Environmental Impact Assessment was received on 4 July 2001.

The Environmental Impact Assessment would entail a further public participation process and detailed specialist investigation.

The specialists have been commissioned to investigate:

- Vegetation
- Birds and butterflies
- Reptiles and Amphibians
- Wetlands and Rivers
- Geohydrology
- Planning
- Visual
- Social
- Archaeology
- Economics

As a result of the public participation process thus far, the need for two further specialist investigations has been identified. These include:

- Tourism
- Pedestrian desire lines

8.3 Specialists: Terms of Reference

The specialists are required to:

- Conduct field studies;
- Interact in the public participation process;
- Use existing data where necessary;
- Confirm and further investigate impacts/issues raised during the Scoping Phase; Recommend mitigation measures to alleviate negative impacts;
- Use specified evaluation criteria to determine the significance of the impact both before mitigation and after;
- Assess implications and provide guidelines for the design, construction and operational phases of the development.

In addition, a successful workshop has been held with the specialists and engineers, so as to allow their interaction within the process.

8.4 Public Participation Process

The methodology for the public participation process involves:

- Continual updating of the I&AP list.

- Distribution of a second Background Information Document to make I&APs aware that the process is continuing.
- Conducting a 'Knock 'n Drop' of background information flyers (English, Afrikaans and Xhosa) to homes adjacent to the proposed road.
- Flyer handouts (English, Afrikaans and Xhosa) at intersections along the proposed route to target road users.
- Hosting Focus Group Meetings aimed at informing chairmen of civic/interest groups and organizations that the process is continuing and to assess whether there are any further issues/impacts that have not been considered during the Scoping Phase. Focus Group Meetings are still to be scheduled with a number of interest groups.
- Placing an advertisement of the Environmental Impact Assessment in the local papers.
- Hosting Open Houses towards the end of August. The exact dates for these, are, as yet uncertain, as we are waiting for the final alignment from the engineers, as we want to present new information to I&APs.
- Public review of the Draft Environmental Impact Assessment Report and further Open Houses are scheduled for September.

8.5 Products

The products of the Environmental Assessment Phase include:

- A Plan of Study for EIA (submitted to the authorities);
- An Environmental Impact Report including:
 - the specialists' inputs
 - the results of the Public Participation Process;
- A Draft Construction Environmental Management Plan, drawn up by M Sasman, to indicate construction mitigation specifications should the project reach the tender phase.

9. Conclusion

In conclusion, P Venter explained the toll strategy development, project viability and the transport economic evaluation of this project.

9.1 Toll Strategy Development

Distances travelled on the existing R300 are relatively short due to the urban nature of the surrounding areas. The traffic report's investigations show that daily trends reveal more people commuting for business purposes on a daily basis and for more than one trip per day. Thus people should be able to afford a toll.

Requirements in regard to discounts on tolls are being investigated (for regular users and those from disadvantaged communities). The prerequisites for the development of a toll strategy were as follows:

- Equitable (The user is to pay for that section of road that he uses)
- Relatively comprehensive (charge fairly for numerous different trip O/D patterns)
- Affordable

P Venter noted that toll plazas would be located on all on- and offramps onto the road. There would be differential toll tariffs on both ramps and the three mainline toll plazas. He added that this is not ideal from an operational point of view, but that it could not be done any other way because of the area's surrounding urban nature.

9.2. Project Viability

The transport economic study helps to prove project viability. A comprehensive financial model is needed for investors who are prepared to take equity.

9.3 Transport Economic Evaluation

The toll rates/income equate to only a portion of the benefit received. There is a benefit to all road users on the Cape Town Road Network:

- Benefit-Cost Ratio = 13,2 (that is, the benefits obtained are greater than vehicle and time costs by this factor)
- Internal Rate of Return = 110%

The above very high economic returns reflect the urban nature of the road and the benefits realised to traffic throughout the metropolitan road network.

P Venter added that this and more information could be found on the website: www.peninsula-expressway.org.za

10. Discussion

S Chand opened the floor for discussion.

COMMENTATOR	COMMENT / QUERY	RESPONDENT	RESPONSE
I Anthony	Are detailed summaries of this presentation available?	P Venter	Yes, together with Background Information Documents.
J Thuynsma	Explain the proposed roads in the south. Vanguard Dr to where?	P Venter	Sector 1 is from Westlake (M3) to Main road (M4) to Prince George Drive to Vanguard Drive (M7). Then up the R300 to the Stellenberg Interchange (N1). The Philippi link runs from Vanguard Drive (M7) to Prince George Drive, crossing Strandfontein Road.
J Thuynsma	To what extent can this toll road affect sensitive vegetation in the south? There is the possibility of the Philippi Link impacting farmlands. I assume this road will run north of the Strandfontein Waste Water Treatment Works. Will it have an effect on development between Strandfontein Road?	P Venter	Yes, the road passes north of the Strandfontein Waste Water Treatment Works.
		S Chand	First, the Philippi Link has been inherited from the City of Cape Town. They have already conducted an EIA and a Record of Decision has been issued. In terms of our study, we are assessing the tolling issue. Second, the Strandfontein Waste Water Sewerage Works and the informally

			labeled False Bay Ecology Park is being analysed in terms of the road impacting the tourist potential of the area. We will learn more about this at the end of the month when the report is due. In terms of biophysical issues, this has most definitely been taken into account: The specialists have written their reports most impacts have a mitigatory measure that can be implemented. It is the cost of these measures however, that render the project unviable..
J Thuynsma	Will these reports be available on the website?	P Venter	Yes, just before the Open Houses. And the specialists themselves will be present at the Open Houses.
J Griffiths	Do we really need these toll plazas?	P Venter	A user would pay for that section of road that he uses. Approximately 75% of trips on existing R300 are business related trips. Users would rarely travel the entire route. One would pay on two occasions: on entry and on exit. Not like the Huguenot Tunnel where you only pay once. Each access/exit point will have a toll plaza.
R Haynie	The locality of this road runs predominantly through disadvantaged areas. What is the financial impact going to be on the community? What happens when it comes to road accidents and claims? Roads are a national function, are they not? What is going to happen to National roads funding?	P Venter	I cannot address these issues – it is not my function. These issues should be addressed by SANRAL and the national government. I can say that funding, from both bodies would be short.
J Griffiths	Mitchell's Plain will be cut off completely. It is very difficult to get onto the R300 from here as it is. If this road is tolled twice, before you even get to work. people will not pay.	P Venter	Noted.

I Anthony	The mind set was different in 1996, which is when this road was thought of. This mindset should perhaps be revisited by the authorities. That is, is the motivation for it the same today as it was then?	P Venter	This should become clear through the public participation process, because of roads running through disadvantaged areas.
I Anthony	You indicated an equitable toll strategy. I don't think that people would be able to even afford to get onto this road. Fuel taxes consist of a lot of things - perhaps we should find out how to get funding for tolls out of this, as you will end up having back roads and an increased number of accidents as they become used over capacity.	P Venter	Noted. If a great traffic load uses one road, for which it is not designed in terms of capacity, accidents will happen. Yes, we do have a fuel levy for the construction and maintenance roads. This is, however, out of our control. In my view, to date, even the National Roads Agency has been unsuccessful in attaining their share of the levy. These are government policies. One would need to address these issues to government. As a private investor, I am using the government policies that are available to me so as to invest. Two important things that we have needed to assess are: a) do we need this road? b) can we toll this road? And so we need to know what the impact is on the user of the road.
I Anthony	I am not going to debate or disagree with you. But, again, the 1996 motivation for this road should be readdressed to see if the need is the same. People will use other back routes.	S Chand	Noted.
I Anthony	Few people are really aware of this proposed road, and you are already pretty far down the decision-making line. What about the agricultural area, which is providing food for half of the Western Cape? This also needs to be looked at as this will affect people's existence.	P Venter	The Minister of Transport makes the final decision on whether this road will affect people's lives to their detriment. In terms of revisiting the motivation for the road, it was in 2001 that the Western Cape Premier gave his approval for the development phase to continue. Note that final

			approvals have not yet been given. Note also that we are getting regular input from ??? throughout the design phase and we are revisiting the needs of I&APs throughout the PPP.
		S Chand	We have conducted the public participation process as legislation requires. An advertisement of the EIA has been published in newspapers, flyers handed out at intersections along the route and so on. We are open to doing more if you can tell us how we can more successfully capture the relevant communities.
G Pascoe	How will disadvantaged areas sustain themselves just by traveling to their place of employment? You must also consider the economy of Mitchell's Plain and the number of people that are unemployed?	S Chand	We note that finances and economy are your concerns and these are clearly an issue.
G Pascoe	We are just echoing the concerns of the community – we have to emphasise this point.	P Venter	Noted. This is not just Mitchell's Plain, but every community which the road passes.
J Thuynsma	What is the alternative route that you are proposing? What impact will this have on me just to go to Westgate Mall?	B Rossouw	Traffic on Vanguard Dr to Westgate Mall will be as it is now. The philosophy behind the toll is as follows: Sitting in traffic is a cost in terms of time and money. You would get a saving on your cost of the toll, that is, you would balance the costs of time and money on the decongested toll road. As the situation is now, Cape Town's central roads are all congested. Two links in the south would loosen up these roads further. And those who can't afford the toll will have better flow. Taxi prices should not be affected as they will be able to do two trips instead of one.
J Thuynsma	Usually, the public transport	B Russouw	Yes, however, most of us

	planning philosophy with regards to 'ring roads' is that these roads must benefit the city's CBD. It should be decongesting the N1 and N2. I don't understand how this road will help that?		have a car and public transport facilities are not great. For example, the crime on trains etc. All of us would like public transport, however, this is something to be solved by Council.
I Anthony	We need a road, not necessarily a toll road.		
M Fienies	How involved are the bus companies and taxis? The infrastructure is there, the road is there, but we don't need the toll.	S Chand	Note that we are to hold a focus group meeting with the Western Cape Provincial Taxi Council. The upgrading and maintenance of this particular section of the proposed road is an issue, however.
M Fienies	Province is responsible for the R300.	P Venter	Yes, and they have the same problem with lack of funds.
I Anthony	We must be creative in order to discover how this can work. I think that we must hold a public meeting for this area to inform the people further.	S Chand	I am not convinced that a public meeting as such would be successful, for the reason that it may be difficult to facilitate. This is an emotive issue. Four Open Houses, however, are to be held, one of which will be held in this area. These would take place over an entire afternoon, and people would be able to come in ask questions to the project team and the specialists directly.
I Anthony	We have a civic centre. Could we not hold the Open House here?	S Chand	Yes, that is indeed a possibility.
R Haynie	Have you considered the social impacts such as sense of place? What is the process that objectors are to follow? Can people still object?	S Chand	Yes, the social assessment has looked at the impact on sense of place. There are some impacts that cannot be resolved, although noise and visual impacts can be decreased. Yes, people can still object, and an appeal can be made against the Record of Decision. Note that there is an appeal process.

13. Conclusion

S Chand thanked all those present for attending and closed the meeting at 11h30.